Promotion and Protection of the Human Rights of Women, Children, Ethnic Minorities, Vulnerable Groups, with particular reference to their Social, Economic and Legal Rights

Douglas Saltmarshe

Centre for Development Studies, University of Bath

January 2000
PROMOTION AND PROTECTION OF THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF WOMEN, CHILDREN, ETHNIC MINORITIES, VULNERABLE GROUPS WITH PARTICULAR REFERENCE TO THEIR SOCIAL, ECONOMIC AND LEGAL RIGHTS

DOUGLAS SALTMARSHE

CENTRE FOR DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF BATH

Tel&Fax: 01225 425785

January 2000

1 This is a revised version of an earlier draft which has attempted where possible to include comments and suggestions by Rosalind Eyben, Neil Thin and Annabel Grant. Copies of the original, longer draft are available from SDD Library, DFID or from CDS, University of Bath
This paper is one of a series of twelve written as outputs of **SD SCOPE: Social Development Systems for Co-ordinated Poverty Eradication**. SD SCOPE was initiated in 1997 by DFID’s Social Development Department. The project ran for two years from January 1998 and was implemented by the Centre for Development Studies at the University of Bath, the Institute for Development Policy and Management at the University of Manchester, and Development Initiatives.

The project’s aims were to: improve DFID’s capacity to support the achievement of positive social outcomes for poor and disadvantaged people; develop systematic approaches to analysing the effectiveness of social development work; and identify and increase access to good practice on social development.

A full list of SD SCOPE papers and authors appears below.

**Theme Papers**

1. Direct assistance to poor and vulnerable people for greater livelihood security (Philippa Bevan, CDS, University of Bath).
3. Support for very poor and marginalised individuals through appropriate social protection (Joseph Mullen, IDPM, University of Manchester, with additional material by Peter Davis, CDS, University of Bath).
4. Protecting and strengthening social capital in order to produce desirable development outcomes (David Hulme, IDPM, University of Manchester).
5. Strengthening policy reform by addressing the needs, interests and rights of poor and vulnerable people (Philippa Bevan, CDS, University of Bath with Stephen Lister, Mokoro).
6. Promotion and protection of the human rights of women, children, ethnic minorities, vulnerable groups (Douglas Saltmarshe, CDS, University of Bath).
7. Strengthening productive capacity and environmental conservation through applied understanding of poor people’s livelihood systems (Peter Oates, Mokoro).
8. Promoting socially responsible business, ethical trade and acceptable labour standards (David Lewis, Centre for Civil Society, LSE).

**Cross-Sectional Papers (drawing on papers 1-8)**

9. Concepts and themes: landscaping social development (Geof Wood, IFIPA, University of Bath)
10. Developing guidelines for assessing achievement in the eight focal areas of social development work and for assessing outcomes (Uma Kothari, IDPM, University of Manchester).
11. Programme approaches: spaces and entry points for social development (Philippa Bevan, CDS, University of Bath).
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive summary</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Introduction</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Key Social Development Objectives</strong></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty reduction</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender and child orientated initiatives</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowerment and good governance</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconstruction and reconciliation</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commentary</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. SD Indicators and Assessment Procedures</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key techniques used for performance assessment</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Programme Approaches</strong></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD advice sought to address problems arising from inadequate</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absence of SD advice in project design</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated SD culture permeates project planning and</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>implementation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Content Analysis</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty alleviation</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender and child initiatives</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance and empowerment</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key findings, models of good practice and lessons learned</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Key Findings and Conclusions</strong></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The study</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social development</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human rights</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bibliography</strong></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

Thanks are due to all SDAs who have provided project material for the theme papers, and those who have given useful feedback and comments on this series of papers. Thanks also to Esse Nilsson, SD SCOPE Social Development Information Coordinator, who identified, located and collected project documents for the authors. Esse Nilsson, Hazel Wallis, SD SCOPE Project Coordinator and Sarah Mathews, SDD, should also be thanked for their editing work on some of the theme papers and for preparing all the papers for publication.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronyms</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community Based Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCP</td>
<td>Disabled Children Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCO</td>
<td>Foreign and Commonwealth Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRP</td>
<td>Feeder Road Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMG</td>
<td>Her Majesty’s Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRE</td>
<td>Human Rights Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IA</td>
<td>Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LBW</td>
<td>Low Birth Weight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOI</td>
<td>Measurable Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTR</td>
<td>Mid Term Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODA</td>
<td>Overseas Development Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Participatory Appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAM</td>
<td>Poverty Aim Marker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDP</td>
<td>Pastoral Development Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIMS</td>
<td>Policy Information Marker System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>Project Memorandum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRA</td>
<td>Participatory Rural Appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRLC</td>
<td>Protection of the rights and Livelihoods of Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTP</td>
<td>Police Training Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFP</td>
<td>Rain-Fed Farming Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RP</td>
<td>Rehabilitation Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RR</td>
<td>Relief and Rehabilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDA</td>
<td>Social Development Adviser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIP</td>
<td>Slum Improvement Project</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Purpose of Paper: To improve the description and definition of human rights (HR) activities usually undertaken by Social Development Advisers (SDAs) and to define outcomes from such work.

Concepts

Working definitions of the theme:
• HR are at the heart of the UK government’s foreign and international development policy.
• HR forms the basis of the Department for International Development’s (DFID) approach to poverty elimination, outlined in the 1997 White Paper as its prime objective.
• DFID’s HR approach stresses freedom, equality of opportunity, and empowerment.
• The relationship between HR and poverty elimination is reflected in policies which provide adequate education, health care, housing, good water, gender awareness and security plus participation in the political and cultural spheres.

HR keywords re. analysis of problem: addressing shortcomings regarding: freedom; equality of opportunity; empowerment.

Objectives

What difference has the Social Development Department sought to achieve through HR as perceived through this study?
• To bring economic benefits through improved access to training.
• Improvement of quality of life for urban poor through community capacity building.
• Reduction of poverty and vulnerability for urban and rural poor.
• Improvement of long term livelihoods through participatory farming systems.
• Protection of rights and livelihoods of working children.
• Improvement in rehabilitation services for disabled children.
• Improvement of governance through producing better trained and more accountable police forces.
• To enhance the legal and social status of women.
• Integration of ethnic communities.
• To provide social, economic and political conditions for refugee return.

HR keywords re. project goals and objectives: improving standards of education, health care, housing, water, gender awareness and security; participation in the political and cultural spheres.

Indicators and Assessment Procedures:

• The value of indicators and assessments are enhanced by accurate and appropriate base line data.
• Baseline information relating to respect for human rights prior to a project would allow outcomes to be better measured and assessed. Typically such information was gained from
gender analysis and various forms of participatory appraisals. Stakeholder analysis was also seen to be useful since it offers an opportunity to clarify correlative duties might exist in respect of the HR issue being addressed.

- Participative impact assessments were being undertaken; these were being critiqued and lessons learned incorporated into assessment procedures.
- Qualitative indicators directly relating to HR activities were limited. This can be attributed to the newly elevated position of the HR approach.
- There remains a need to generate measures relating to rights, access and inclusion. Such as measuring extent to which governmental bodies were representative in order gauge the degree of ethnic participation and the degree democratisation. Legislation relating to a particular HR activity; publications; formation of Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) can all be measures of HR initiatives.

*Indicator Keywords: Baseline surveys; gender analysis; stakeholder analysis; Participative Learning Assessment; participative Mid-Term Reviews and Impact Assessments; legislation; CSO formation.*

**Programme Approaches:**

- In the early part of the time frame under consideration HR were not explicitly integrated into projects as such. However projects frequently had dimensions which addressed HR concerns. As such they tended to be of an inclusive nature. They were enabling to the extent that were involved in capacity building of government of institutions.
- During the second half of the period under consideration HR were explicitly addressed. The projects which appeared most successful incorporated approaches which blended enabling, inclusive and focused activity.
- Education, training, communication and capacity building were the principal means whereby HR agendas were operationalised.

**Lessons Learned and Good Practice:**

- A rights agenda requires that a state is obliged to respect, protect, promote and ensure the realisation of human rights. This is a fundamental statement and can be used as yardstick against which policy is measured.
- The Human Rights agenda reflects a liberal vision and places particular emphasis on the rights of the individual. This presupposes the existence of a virtuous set of state institutions to which individuals can turn to for protection and justice. It presupposes a society where individuals are free to organise themselves around issues of common concern. A rights orientated aid policy inevitably involves donors addressing structural/legal issues in partner countries where rights are not respected.
- With a rights based approach forming a cornerstone of DFID’s aid policy, country policy documents could usefully include an inventory of the major rights issues. Such data could then be used to strategise and prioritise assistance and assess interventions.
- A rights agenda involves the assertion of values. The assertion of rights requires accessible
institutions through which rights can be claimed and asserted. Herein lies the linkage between human rights and political arenas.

- The existence of HR are unknown to most poor people. Therefore any HR orientated programme needs to include a strong educative element whereby there is a transfer of information supported by appropriate explanation as to the role and function, duties and obligations involved in HR. This sensitisation is an important component behind any HR input. It starts a process by which a contentious issue can be understood, labelled and articulated.
- Because a project is financially small does not mean that its impact cannot be significant. This is especially so in the field of human rights initiatives. There is some concern arising from this study that smaller projects might not be getting sufficient and timely Social Development support.
- The issue of the cultural relativity of human rights needs to be taken into account. Furthermore, notwithstanding the arguments against it, human rights for many people may be of a hierarchical nature.
- There exist issues of conflicting and competing rights. These are often manifest as a conflict between individual rights and the common good.
- A stakeholder analysis which provides information about the various forms of interest held by actors in a project would be useful in assessing HR correlative duties and providing information which could be used in the risks and assumptions column of the logframe.
- In order to integrate a rights orientated approach into development programmes a set of practical guidelines would be most useful achieved in part by utilising existing resources and also by updating Technical Notes These could provide practical guidance based on case study experience as to how human rights could best be integrated into the process approach, sectoral aid and the different types of involvement associated with focused, inclusive and enabling activities.

Final Keywords: freedom; equality of opportunity; empowerment; improvement in quality of life; participative assessments; legislation; CSO formation; responsibilities; education; conscientisation.
1. Introduction

This study took place within the context of a substantial change in the status and agenda of British foreign development assistance associated with the incoming 1997 Labour administration which gave the Overseas Development Administration (ODA) departmental status, renaming it the Department for International Development (DFID). The White Paper presented in November 1997 and subsequent statements by Secretary of State Clare Short have reoriented policies to be consistent with a target of eliminating world poverty during the 21st century. The White Paper (1997:§1.11) acknowledged the creativity, strength and dynamism of the poor in their daily struggle to survive. It outlined how the British Government intended to set about starting to work towards the goal of global poverty elimination in the next century. There is therefore a strong normative element in the formulation of the Labour Government’s policy which is further reflected in the promotion of an ethical foreign policy and the incorporation of human rights as a core feature of its vision of sustainable development. Human rights are therefore fundamental to the new government’s activity and are “at the heart of its foreign and international development policy” (DFID 1998:7). As the basis of its approach to poverty elimination the human rights approach stresses freedom, equality of opportunity and empowerment (ibid. p.23).

The contemporary human rights discourse is based upon the premise of the universality of human rights and on these rights being equally applicable to every human being. The discourse is founded upon the primacy of the 1948 United Nations Declaration on Human Rights which consists of 53 Articles covering a wide spectrum of rights. These have later been more concretely expressed in a number of instruments (see Langley 1992), among the most important are: The 1952 Convention relating to refugees and the subsequent Protocol and Declaration of 1967, The Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966), The Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966), a number of conventions concerned with the prevention of discrimination and intolerance which concern employment, gender, race, crimes against humanity and the Declaration of the Rights of the Child (1959).

In a speech entitled Beyond the White Paper (at ODI 4/3/98) DFID’s Chief Social Development Adviser Rosalind Eyben stated that a rights-based approach to development, along with social capital and social exclusion approaches, formed three new frameworks for social development policy analysis. A human rights approach to development is outlined in a discussion paper commissioned by DFID (Häusermann 1998). This polemical document asserts a range of norms and in so doing seeks to integrate a human rights approach into the rationale of development and as such it must be assumed is a key document in outlining why and how DFID seeks to incorporate human rights into its development approach. Since the inception of the two 1966 Covenants there has been a concentration by the developed nations on civil and political rights, which has tended to be at the expense of concern with the economic, social and cultural rights. The former, being concerned with issues of structure and ideology, reflected political preoccupations, particularly during the period of the Cold War, whereas the latter are more concerned with direct economic issues, support for which have resource implications and a tacit acceptance of redistributive norms. Häusermann (1998:67) explicitly articulates the relationship between rights and poverty as being reflected in policies which provide adequate education, health care, housing, water, gender awareness and security plus participation in the political and cultural spheres. The realignment in the role of the state
in the light of the failure of communism and the shortcomings of extreme liberalism which have emerged over the preceding fifty years has seen an increased emphasis placed on human rights.

The task of this desk study derives from the dual nature of its focus. On the one hand it is targeted on the technical aspects of ODA/DFID’s project formulation and implementation from the perspective of Social Development (SD), while on the other it is concerned with the epistemological and practical issues related to a rights based approach to development.

Methodology

As has been stated, the inclusion of human rights into its development agenda has been a key feature of the incoming Labour administration. This is not to say that human rights norms were not reflected in ODA under the Conservative government. While rarely referred to in explicit terms, concern for human rights could be seen to influence the formulation of programmes for the delivery of assistance in health, education, good governance, gender equality and empowerment. In order to undertake this review of DFID’s activities related to HR, a range of projects of varying size, type and region will be examined. The following have been selected (bracketed identifying code words are used throughout the paper):


1993-7 (extended to 1999) Western India Rainfed Farming Project Phase 1 £3.51 million (India RFP).


1997-8 Western Bosnia Rehabilitation Programme £500,000 (Bosnia RP).

1998-9 Western Bosnia Return and Reconciliation Project £1.1 million (Bosnia RR).

1997-2000 Protection of the rights and livelihoods of children in Pakistan £750,000 (Pakistan PRLC).

1994-7 NGO: Uganda Society for Disabled Children £283,000 (Uganda DCP).


Also referred to are:

1999-2005 India Rainfed Farming Project Phase 2 £20.47 million.

1997-2001 Calcutta Slum Improvement Project Phase 1c, £2.3 million.

The projects were largely taken from lists provided by DFID. A number of more recently approved projects have been suggested by DFID staff. These have been incorporated into the review to illustrate the manner in which an intensified concern with human rights is being reflected in project design. DFID's human rights themes include those relating to children, women, conflict, various forms of discrimination, elections and democracy, poverty elimination, HR awareness and good governance. The nature of this study makes it impractical to look at all of these so four principal areas of concern as they relate to human rights are drawn upon. They are:

- Poverty reduction (Wajir PDP, India RFP, Mozambique FR, Calcutta SIP).
- Gender and child orientated initiatives (Calcutta SIP, Uganda DCP, Pakistan PRLC).
- Empowerment and good governance (Pacific HRE; Pakistan PT).
- Reconstruction and reconciliation (Bosnia RR, Bosnia RP).

This categorisation of the selected projects is made on the basis of primary features. In actuality many of them encompass one or more of these categories. For example a focus on gender equality takes place in Pacific HRE, Wajir PDP and India RFP. By examining header sheets with Policy Information Markers System (PIMS) (where provided), Project Memoranda (PMs), Mid Term Reviews (MTRs) and final reviews, I will seek to establish the extent to which the key objectives of these projects have reflected this human rights agenda. Passing reference will be made to some current projects, namely: Wajir PDP phase 2, India RFP phase 2, Pakistan PRLC and Bosnia RR in order to illustrate how project goals and construction are being reformulated in response to changes in DFID priorities.
2. Key Social Development Objectives

Poverty reduction

*Mozambique FRP*:
PIMS 4 - Poverty reduction, sustainable agriculture / PIMS 2 - private sector development/ PIMS 1 - Human Development health, Human Development education.

Under the aegis of support for reconstruction, the project was initially largely formulated on technical grounds with a weak SD input. It is assumed that the PIMS score for poverty reduction was based on facilitating economic development rather than through direct inclusion of poor and vulnerable groups. Inclusion of such groups was only a tentatively addressed in the PM (§11.3). The criteria of economic rates of return was used to justify the project, rather than concern for directing benefits accruing from construction towards poorer groups. The result was the absence of conditionality in arrangements with contractors which could ensure that the project benefits filtered down to the most marginal groups. The project appeared to be primarily conceived as a technical one (see Draft Inception Report) with SD being something of an added component. The PM gave scant attention to an issue mentioned in an undated Project Concept Note: "the main beneficiaries of the road rehabilitation...will be the larger commercial companies and smallholder farmers risk losing their rights to land and access to the many of the benefits of road rehabilitation as land values increase". The assumption in the logframe appeared to be that SD benefits such as schools and clinics would simply come about as a result of the improved access created by the new roads. Nonetheless this there was a more useful SD input which will be subsequently described.

**Keyphrase**: Sustainable improvement in access for rural population.

**Logframe**: Outputs exclusively relate to road construction with only cursory mention of maintenance arrangements. No acknowledgement of meaningful SD objectives.

*Calcutta SIP*:
Projects 1a and 1b formulated in 1991, pre-PIMS. However no PIMS provided for 1c (1997).

The primary project objective was poverty alleviation by means of socio-economic integration, which incorporated a health and family planning component and the enhancement of community institutional capacity with special attention being paid to women and children. Although a considerable portion of the project was concerned with a wide range of infrastructure improvements, it also included skill training, a literacy programme, credit for women and most significantly, the establishment of a community development department within the Calcutta Municipality which enabled residents to have an institutional channel through which they could influence the project by expressing their self-defined needs (§6.9 PM). The project was unusual for ODA in that physical improvements preceded community development activities (§18.1 PM). This was done in order to ensure a community development department was included into the Municipality and to encourage the approach to be used as widely as possible within Calcutta as quickly as possible. However ‘community’ was presented in the PM and logframe as a homogenous entity with little detail being given about the nature of communities, the extent to which they were defined by place of origin or
other distinguishing features. While it was never expressed as such, the project related to a number of rights based issues such as the rights to health, to an adequate standard of living, to non-discrimination of women and rights to education.

**Keyphrase:** To improve the quality of life for urban poor.

**Logframe:** Outputs/activities included increasing standards of literacy, health and community life by the removal of constraints to economic development by encouraging community development, by increasing employment opportunities for women and assisting them achieve practical and strategic gender needs.

**Wajir PDP:**
PIMS: 4 - Poverty reduction.

Designed to reduce poverty and vulnerability in a marginal agricultural area, the PM described how the project was designed to achieve both sustainable livelihoods by means of a range of technical and social development activities which included what amounted to pre-emptive conflict resolution between settled agriculturalists and migrant pastoralists. Tensions between these groups grew during droughts. The capacity building component of the project was intended to foster the development of pastoral associations and a steering committee in order to identify problems and through negotiations reduce tensions on sensitive issues. The PM recognised the extent to which women's rights under Islamic law had been eroded and was initially cautious in pushing the gender issue (MTR III.13.2 p.14). However the knowledge and confidence gained during the early phase was incorporated into the second half of the project and expanded to be given high priority in phase 2 of the project. The project also addressed the development of viable alternative livelihoods.

**Keyphrase:** Reduction of poverty and vulnerability in pastoral and settled communities.

**Logframe:** Outputs/activities structured to improve sustainable livelihoods and self-reliance in target groups. Training in relation to animal and human health improvement. Institutional strengthening of CBOs. Establishment of baseline data and relevant indicators.

**India RFP:**
PIMS 4 - Direct assistance to poor people / sustainable agriculture / desertification. PIMS 2 - Enhancing productive capacity / women/male equality / environment.

In a drought-prone region of NW India, this project was designed to advance poverty focused, gender sensitive and participatory approaches to rain-fed farming systems by the establishment of village based institutions which could sustain the initiative once the project was completed. There was also a technical research and development component to the project and poverty sensitive research into natural resource development and income generation.

**Keyphrase:** Improvement of long term livelihoods through participatory farming systems development.
**Logframe:** The ambitious range of SD related outputs included Participatory Rural Appraisals (PRAs), annual village plans, participatory monitoring and evaluation design, representative committees. Incorporation of women into the PRAs, staff training in gender awareness. There was also a human resource component which included training for a wide range of stakeholders.

**Gender and child orientated initiatives**

**Gender**
Concern for gender equity was integrated into most projects. However it was instructive to note the manner and extent to which it was done. Of the poverty related projects, the Wajir PDP took an understandably cautious approach to gender related issues (MTR p19). However as confidence increased the second half of the first phase more actively addressed the position of women. So in Wajir PDP phase 2 (1997-2000) with improved knowledge, particularly of poverty in female headed households, gender considerations played a much larger part in the project construction.

Assistance to increase employment and participation in community development was one of the Immediate Objectives of the Calcutta SIP (see logframe). The India RFP was designed to recognise women's role in environmental management and sought to address their practical and strategic needs. The Pacific HRE (see below) was particularly concerned with furthering the effective legal rights of women through lobbying and dissemination. The Pakistan PTP did not include a gender dimension in the project summary or logframe, although it was given a PIMS value of 1. Nevertheless the lack of policewomen was noted in the PM where the response was stated in terms of "seeking" to address the issue. In fact considerable progress was made as was evidenced in the MTR (p.51) but it is anomalous that the position of women in Pakistan society and their need for special consideration was not integrated into the logframe.

From this selection of projects, the one which singularly failed to address the special needs of women was the Mozambique FRP. Women were neither mentioned in the logframe nor in the social and institutional appraisal (PM §11).

**Keyphrases:** Not applicable

**Logframes:** ensuring needs and views of women included in PRAs / increase women’s role in strategic decision making / assist women increase their opportunities for employment and participation in community strategic planning / focus on practical and strategic gender needs.

**Children**

**Pakistan PRLC:**
PIMS 4 - Direct assistance to poor people / equality between men and women. PIMS 2 - Human development (education).

This rights based project reflects the concerns emanating from the ‘North’ for the situation of children in Pakistan working in the sporting goods industry. The project goal was outlined under the UN Convention of the Rights of the Child as to demonstrably protect the rights and
livelihoods of working children. The project is in line with DFID’s intention to promote ethical business and eradicate abusive child labour. It was primarily concerned with children and women working in the Sialkot football stitching industry and to a lesser extent with children in Sindh. The project sought to protect the interests of children being excluded from the football stitching industry becoming involved in less benign activities such as carpet making, fishing and brickworks in order to maintain family livelihoods. Risks mentioned in the PM were “resistance from working children and their families losing their jobs” and the Atlanta Agreement (behind the northern sanctions) which could force women as well as children out of work (PM p.12).

**Keyphrase:** Protecting the rights and livelihoods of working children.

**Logframe:** Family incomes maintained or increased. Training opportunities provided for children and their families.

*Uganda DCP:*

PIMS 4 - Poverty reduction. PIMS 2 - health.

This project for disabled children sought to create opportunities for disabled children to grow and develop their potential in a home environment. It was selected for this study because it was co-funded, a relatively small grant and it directly concerned human rights. The supply of documentation for the project was very poor. Despite repeated requests only pages 11-14 of the PM were supplied and we received no logframe. Pages 1 & 3, 10-11, 19-28 of a MTR were supplied. Although the project concluded on 31/3/98, no end of project report was available. There were clear mismatches observable between the project objectives and the project's components which could derive from the certain ambiguities inherent in the way the project aims were described. These revolved around seeking to make rehabilitation the responsibility of disabled persons and their families so that they would be able to seek services rather than expect them, whereas the real aim of the project activities actually seemed to be to establish a clear referral system from the disabled child at home up to the district level (PM p.13). No account was provided about what the disabled children and their families thought about this initiative. Sustainability was said to arise from improvement of functional status, participation and integration, development of productive capacity and empowerment (PM p.11). While these are fine ideals there was no evidence provided as to how they would be practically achieved. The absence of a logframe hinders a constructive critique. From the material provided the point can be made that the expressed desire to provide knowledge on the causes, prevention and management of disability to the disabled and their families as an objective is not clearly and adequately reflected in the project goals. These were listed as rehabilitation, training of personnel and support for referral services.

**Keyphrases:** Project description: a) Rehabilitate services for disabled children (header sheet). b) To make disabled children live independent and productive lives. (PM - project aim)

**Logframe:** Not supplied.
Empowerment and good governance

Pakistan PTP:
PIMS 4 - Good government. PIMS 1 - Women in development.

The project was established in 1995 with the intention of making the police force more effective and accountable. The PM and logframe indicate the linking of good governance with social development and human rights. The SD goals were to be achieved by sensitising the police to the needs of the community with subsidiary attention being paid to the needs of women. By increasing the number of female police officers and developing female operated police stations the intention was to make the police station a place where women felt they could go.

Keyphrase: Establishment of government capacity to impart command skills to senior police officers.

Logframe: Provision of courses relevant to modern policing, especially community policing and its relation to gender issues. However lacking explicit details of how community and gender aspects were to be addressed. Sensitisation to specialist skills. Weak log frame.

Pacific HRE:
No PIMS supplied.

Suggested by DFID as a good example of HR work, the project is one which cross cuts education, governance and social development with the intention "to enhance the legal and social status of women in the Pacific". Its purpose was to qualitatively and quantitatively increase women's human and legal rights through the provision of HR information and technical assistance. The project directly related to HR development and to the empowerment of women through training in HR legal literacy, advocacy and dissemination, in so doing it also raised awareness of the HR approach in its broadest sense.

Keyphrase: Enhance the legal and social status of women.

Logframe: Increasing legal literacy and rights awareness by means of training and dissemination of materials and research. Promotion of advocacy programmes relating to legislative reform which adversely effects women and the testing of laws in key areas affecting women.

Reconstruction and reconciliation

Bosnia RP:
No PIMS supplied.

This projects was a precursor to a more carefully thought out approach to refugee return and reconciliation. Bosnia RP was a joint ODA/military project. Its goal was to contribute to a democratic and multi-ethnic Bosnia. Its purpose was to support Dayton and the outputs were infrastructure development and a range of welfare and economic activities. The project
focused on conflict reduction and encouragement of inter-ethnic co-operation so as to further the political aims of the Dayton agreement. However the implementation arrangements implied that the project was being seen primarily as a process of physical activities with the main concerns being the misuse of resources and safety of project personnel (PM p.16). Scant attention was given to issues of social development or human rights (or how these could be used mitigate corruption and personnel safety). Areas which complied with Dayton were to be favoured. The PM was authoritarian in tone and mechanical in its approach to project construction.

**Keyphrase:** To further the implementation of the framework for a durable peace in Bosnia.

**Logframe:** Logframe removed from PM.

**Bosnia RR:**
No PIMS supplied.

The PM (27/1/98) shows a radical shift in project approach. Integration and local democratisation were incorporated into the project to become its prime focus (PM p2). Respect for human rights was further incorporated into the project goals as defined in the logframe (p4). The verifiable indicator for this refers to "sustainable minority returns". The logframe and planning process thus acknowledged the link between human rights and sustainable development by placing HR as the feature around which the project was structured. This represented a substantial change in view point from Bosnia RP.

**Keyphrases:** To encourage return of refugees to fully integrated communities. To provide social, economic and political conditions so that refugees can make free, informed choices about return.

**Logframe:** SD and HR outputs took priority and informed the provision of physical outputs. They included a range of HR, democratisation and reconciliation activities to support employment creation and infrastructure improvement.

**Commentary**

**PIMS:** Using the 1996 version of PIMS, under which most of the selected projects would have been classified, the evidence indicates that the system was useful in defining the purpose of a project. However the value of the 1996 PIMS would appear to be more as an internal classificatory system rather than as a tool to influence project design. So if we look at two projects with high poverty alleviation scores, Calcutta SIP and Mozambique FRP, the SD input in the former was very high and in the other initially very low. The PIMS did little to encourage a more uniform approach which took into account the SD input, in fact it had the reverse effect in that it tended to mask differences since it assumed scores incorporated qualitative and quantitative measures.

**Human Rights:** The theme of human rights was not overtly articulated and translated into project goals until mid 1997. Nevertheless by isolating the four themes (p.4), it can be observed that HR related activities have been put into practice over the past 8 years albeit
under different descriptions, one such being good governance. The Pakistan PTP was concerned with sensitising that police force to a range of rights based issues. The notable exception to this was the Pacific HRE which as early as 1995 overtly set out to establish a programme which could enhance the legal and social status of women in the Pacific. In the Pacific HRE we see a project defined and orientated towards institutionalising the rights of women into national legislation and moreover spreading knowledge about these rights as deeply as possible into national communities. Objectives were successfully translated into outputs. The Pakistan PTP was an example of improving governance through training. The rights agenda was introduced as a result of the 1998 MTR and the original somewhat unambitious SD project goals were extended by introducing participatory poverty assessments which canvas the views of the poor on government services and policing issues (Pakistan PTP MTR p.50).

The return and reconciliation projects were deeply bound up with a range of human rights. Bosnia RP was remarkable in that it ignored the discourse entirely whereas Bosnia RR illustrated the very positive way in which rights could be integrated into such project. The problem confronted in Bosnia RR was that there were such a range of conflicting or problematic rights which related to this set of circumstances. These included: rights of self-determination, liberty and security, liberty of movement, freedom of thought, conscience and religion, freedom of association, equal protection under the law, rights to enjoy culture, religion or language (from Civil & Pol.Conv.1966). There are also the Conventions and Declarations concerning the Prevention of Discrimination and Intolerance plus the Conventions, Protocol and Declaration on nationality, asylum and refugees. Despite this the PM focused on key rights which related to the project goal and produced an impressive set of outputs and activities to attempt to achieve them.

**Poverty Alleviation:** With the exception of Mozambique FRP which initially had a very weak SD input, poverty alleviation was undertaken in a variety of participatory ways. The modalities of approach used in Wajir PDP, India RFP and Calcutta SIP, stem from similar premises which pervade the programme outputs. While there was a common theme which sought to encourage self-reliance, the participative nature of the projects differ considerably. This is to be expected in the circumstances pertaining in pastoralism, rain fed agriculture and urban renewal, however the defining of what is meant by participation could assist in the clearer definition of projects. Is it consultation? Who is defining goals? In what ways, if at all, is ownership being conferred?

In the context of the HR discourse, the nettle needs to be grasped concerning the setting of goals which make direct reference to the Economic, Social and Cultural rights. So long as projects are solely concerned with increasing economic well-being through, say, the expansion of road systems, urban infrastructure development, agricultural research and extension then project parameters are quite clear. But if a rights agenda is to be integrated into the design of poverty related projects then an aspect of the project needs to focus on the rights of primary stakeholders to a certain quality of life. This involves the incorporation of some form of political conscientisation in the project process which constructively assists primary stakeholders in laying claims on their governments in respect of the way that resources are both allocated and managed. The benefit of incorporating the rights agenda into projects
designed to mitigate or alleviate poverty is that it has the potential to increase the important dimension of agency, by means of which the structural causes of poverty can be addressed.

**Gender Equity:** Looking at the way in which issues of gender equity were incorporated into project design we can see three broad positions. The first is where they were given no consideration at all, such as in Mozambique FRP, Uganda DCP and Bosnia RP. These were all projects which were problematic in social development terms. The second group included India RFP, Wajir PDP and Pakistan PTP in which gender related issues were subsidiary to the main goals of the project but as confidence and understanding was gained by a range of project actors, the special needs of women were incorporated into the project framework. The final group were those which were specifically orientated towards women such as Pacific HRE and Calcutta SIP in which the rights of women formed a dominant element in influencing project design.

**Children:** There were two projects in this selection which were focused on children: Pakistan PRLC and Uganda DCP. The former provided an instance of where the rights of the child were bound up with particular international financial interests, where northern concerns, and leverage, supported a very particular perspective on rights of the child. It was impossible to make any judgement about the Uganda DCP (project terminated 31/3/97) through incomplete documentation and lack of a final report. What was presented of the PM and the goals, outputs and activities of the project appeared to be written with intent of appealing to known donor positions (self-reliance, cost effectiveness, exit strategies) rather than elaborating an approach which would inform and empower in addition to bringing material benefits for disabled children and their families. From the information available this appeared to be a confused project. The limited availability of material increased concern about the project. A final report would have been helpful.

If this cross section of projects is a representative one, children would not appear to have a high profile in the constellation of activities which have been funded by ODA/DFID. Apart from the two projects just mentioned, which were both problematic in different ways, only Calcutta SIP had a component concerned with the provision of assistance specifically to children.
3. SD Indicators and Assessment Procedures

Indicators

Over the ten projects considered here, there was a general lack of consistency in respect of indicators used in each sector. To some extent this might be because of the changing appreciation of the value of social development taking place over the period time covered by this selection of projects. Clearly the logframe, its indicators and their means of verification can be seen as a part of an iterative process.

The logframes largely relied on quantitative methods of assessment. This permitted an insight into the degree to which social development objectives were being genuinely addressed at the PM stage of planning and during the initial phase of implementation.

Indicators and their means of verification therefore clearly demonstrated the degree to which a project balanced:

- Issues of social development;
- mechanisms for technocratic development;
- being a means to a political end.

The tendency for SD related issues to have a strong quantitative bias and reflected an unjustified lack of confidence in the qualitative aspects of SD approaches. Indicators which provide evidence about how people feel about processes and interventions and that seek to describing well-being by measures other than income, can be an arguably more objective means of measurement than statistical analyses which can be driven with concealed subjectivities.

In formulating appropriate indicators for human rights due attention needs to be given as to how rights are bound up with networks of obligation. There is also a linkage between the assertion of human rights and the political/legislative arena. These issues were illustrated in Bosnia RR and Pacific HRE. In the latter project there was not only concern for the normative aspects of human rights but also in enabling women to influence the legislative process. The development of appropriate qualitative indicators which can be used in assessing how the presence (or absence) of HR is affecting stakeholders plays an important part in constructing baseline data and measuring the quality of compliance to HR norms. However deciding on the nature of qualitative baseline HR data is complicated by the perception of rights by target groups who might value certain rights over others, such as economic rights over particular social or cultural rights. Furthermore project indicators need to take into account linkages and relations of dependency between target groups and other actors (such as football manufacturers, the police, the state) so as to be able to measure or reveal the extent to which a particular right is acknowledged and, more to the point, being responded to. This entails careful use of the assumptions/risks column in the logframe. The types of indicator which are required are those which provide qualitative information about how the participative approaches now being initiated effect those whose rights are not being adequately respected, particularly those of the poor. In the case of the reformulated Pakistan PTP (1998 MTR) this
would be so as to capture how community policing and sensitisation to the rights of women were impacting on the effectiveness, accountability and legitimacy of the police.

What is highlighted throughout the study of this set of documents is that projects are to varying degrees of a dialectical nature, that is to say they represent a set of negotiations. Where there was a lack of communication between stakeholders, then there were problems, probably fairly substantial problems which would be reflected in the indicators and their Means of Verification.

The indicators from the projects are categorised in the four principal areas presented in the first chapter of this study.

**Poverty reduction**
- **Physical indicators**: Such as increases in schools, clinics and shops as a result of the road.
- **Health related indicators**: Increased number of people practising family planning, reduction of low birth weight babies, 100% immunisation.
- **Community development indicators**: Relating to numbers of trained people and meetings of community groups, number of formed associations.
- **Indicators for capacity building**: Number of groups with functioning accountable programmes.
- **Indicators measuring sustainability**: Membership, accountability, representativity, measures of inclusivity i.e. co-operation with other organisations/government and measures of autonomy reflecting the progressive lack of dependency on external change agent.
- **Quantitative indicators measuring inclusion**: Numbers of households receiving more than 20% increase in incomes, fodder and fuel from farming system development (FSD); number of villagers independently using skills developed through project; number of women reporting practical benefits and enhanced roles in FSD.

**Gender and child orientated initiatives**
- **Participatory qualitative indicators**: The training of legal literacy teachers whose acquired skills were verified by trainees; the production of legal literacy material evaluated in villages; advocacy programmes for legislative reform assessed in terms of media coverage.
- **Quantitative indicators**: Number of groups formed, number of people receiving benefits etc.
- **Children's indicators**: Related to income, standard of living, education, recreation, skills training, the provision of rights based information and understanding in "pressure" (probably advocacy) campaigns; the development of models for partnership between NGOs and the privates sector in resolving child labour problems.

**Empowerment and good governance**
- **Qualitative empowerment indicator**: Increasing women’s legal knowledge in respect of their rights.
• **Quantitative empowerment indicators:** Production of appropriate materials; provision of appropriate training to the most vulnerable women, especially involving those who are illiterate.

**Reconstruction and reconciliation**
Indicators either not given or not yet formulated.

**Key techniques used for performance assessment**

• The appraisal resulting in the PM, PIMS and logframe is a form of assessment. These three instruments can be seen as representing a set of judgements relating to the expected behaviour of various project actors. Project approval in part relates to how accurate these assessments are likely to be.

• The logframe is a powerful tool both for analysis and implementation and was valued by MTR, impact assessment and final review teams. However this was not necessarily the case in the field where in some instances logframes were not strictly adhered to.

• The logframe was seen to be valuable in structuring a project and establishing processes of accountability, but the way in which it was used emphasised physical outputs/activities, and thus indicators, rather than social outcomes.

• Qualitative indicators were seldom used in the logframes. However the advice and support of SDAs was extremely helpful in establishing MTR and IAs which produced relevant qualitative data. The issue of developing qualitative monitoring procedures is one which remains to be fully explored.

• Weak SD focus at the design stage of projects resulted in a lack of relevant qualitative base line data. This created difficulties in establishing causal linkages in the assessment of project outcomes and constrained the effectiveness of MTRs, Participatory Impact Assessments and Final Reviews.

• The linking of stakeholder analysis with a participation matrix, as occurred post 1997, produced a clearer definition of the roles and expectations of various project actors resulting in greater clarity of project design and improved implementation.

• By providing a preliminary impact assessment, MTRs/OPRs were seen to be useful in redirecting or improving a project through the production of key findings which could be incorporated into further phases of the project. Furthermore the increasingly participatory nature of MTRs appears to strengthen the project by increasing the involvement and ‘ownership’ of primary stakeholders.

• MTR missions can draw attention to resource constraints and significantly reorient a project. In one case (Pakistan PTP) the mission team built upon the project’s modest achievements by reinforcing the integration of human rights perspectives and encouraging initiatives to incorporate gender issues into the project. By providing a
detailed and comprehensive action plan the mission greatly strengthened the project's prospects.

- Final assessments were handled in a number of ways. Participatory impact assessment could be most impressive through providing with rich and varied data supported by a range of qualitative indicators. Calcutta SIP (PIA p. 8) reflected slum dwellers perceptions of the situation before and after the project intervention and indicated their level of satisfaction with various aspects of the project. Where they were undertaken, PIA's proved to be most useful.

- Final Assessments were infrequent but where they were undertaken provided useful information. Similarly the participatively conducted Economic Impact Assessment was an interesting tools which was rarely used.

- Final documents can provide a rounded appreciation of a project’s impact and success. Some degree of standardisation of the end of project review would be helpful for comparative purposes. Ideally it would include a synthesis of qualitative and quantitative results supported by comments from the various DFID actors involved. Final documents provide one means of institutional learning.

- There has been a recent shift in British Government aid towards multi-lateral sectoral assistance and ‘process approaches’. Within DFID these developments have been set within the more flexible approach offered by the PAM system. This identifies interventions as being focused, inclusive or enabling\(^2\) (see PIMS 1998 p.15-16 and Evans, 1998). What appears to be evolving is a more adaptable and responsive approach to the delivery of assistance.

- With human rights forming a cornerstone of British aid policy there is a need to explore how a rights approach can best be operationalised within this evolving context. There are a number of examples where HR has been successfully integrated project formulation (Pacific HRE and Bosnia RR) which illustrate the value of the approach. In order to expand on this, a set practical guidelines would be valuable in bridging the gap between broad statements of principal and the integration of HR into the process approach, sectoral aid and the different types of involvement associated with focused, inclusive and enabling activities.

\(^2\) Focused Action is predominantly aimed at the rights, interests and needs of poor people. Inclusive Actions are broad-based actions which improve opportunities and generally and also address equity and participation. Enabling Actions support the policies and context for poverty reduction.
4. Programme Approaches

Following from the conclusion of the previous section, what is apparent from this study is how the project is in reality a process, the first part of which is the PM and logframe. These provide the basis for mediation, to a greater or lesser extent, by various actors and circumstance through the life of the project. Therefore while programmes are fairly clearly defined constructions, their component parts, the projects, are much more negotiated phenomena. In order to address how they are approached, three differing sets of circumstances in which SD inputs, informed by HR principals, have influenced project design are identified.

SD advice sought to address problems arising from inadequate planning

Approaches used:
Advisory missions by SDAs/SD consultants addressing:

- Monitoring procedures for social impact assessment;
- effects of new roads on land ownership and registration;
- gender analysis;
- participatory appraisals;
- the direction of labour towards more disadvantaged groups.

Absence of SD advice in project design

The introduction of SD advice resulted in the operationalisation of:

- Integrated HR and SD perspectives;
- stakeholder analysis;
- confidence building measures between former protagonists in target group achieved by integrating HRs with the notion of reconciliation;
- HR dimensions into project design;
- local democratisation into project design.

Integrated SD culture permeates project planning and implementation

SD culture exemplified by:

- SD perspectives at inform project conception;
- basic SD objectives and practice integrated at planning stage;
- SD orientation in all technical improvements;
- a focus on community development;
- participation in the political process enhanced by placing a community development department within the Municipality;
- the SDA generating co-operation with local counterparts;
- a partner NGO sympathetic to participatory approaches and gender equality;
- encouraging communities to take responsibility for implementing their action plans.
To conclude, the HR agenda assists in defining focus and modality of approach. As such it deepens the manner in which SD approaches can contribute to successful project formulation and implementation. Evidence from the projects under review highlights the importance of timely SD advice. Where SD advice was sought at a post planning stage in an effort to redress problems arising during implementation, or which had come to light as a result of a MTR, SD advice could redress or mitigate certain problems. However, it could not easily or effectively address project orientation.

The materials used in this study also indicate that access to sources of SD advice can be critical to the successful implementation of a project. Where such advice is not available then there exist problematic project scenarios (described in original draft). On the other hand where SD perspectives are firmly rooted in the development culture of planning units and where SD advice is readily available, then large projects were seen to be successfully conceived and implemented. Even in the few projects examined here it is noteworthy how frequently SD advisers and consultants have galvanised and catalysed problematic projects by means of an implicit or explicit rights orientated approach.
5. Content Analysis

The title of this paper is concerned with human rights, however as this was not explicitly part of ODA/DFID policy prior to spring 1997, I am examining the four topics of poverty alleviation; gender and children initiatives; governance and empowerment; and lastly, reconstruction and reconciliation.

Poverty alleviation

Projects which have a high SD input are evidently better placed to produce outcomes deemed successful by DFID. Those projects with high SD input used in this study (Calcutta SIP, India RFP and Wajir PDP) were all followed up and extended. The content and tone of the new PMs indicate vigorous and productive projects where considerable learning has taken place and been applied to second phase activities. It is assumed that all of the projects were successful in achieving their objectives of poverty alleviation.

Gender and child initiatives

The mainstreaming of concern for gender equity, which is a fundamental human right, can be seen to have progressed during the period covered by the projects under examination. Even in projects with medium to low SD input, gender has been integrated and the analysis of qualitative data would indicate the degree to which this has been successful. From the material made available indications are very positive in this respect.

In one case (Uganda DCP) more could have been done to clearly differentiate between the medical and social models of disability (see Coleridge 1993) and associated courses of action. While not diminishing the need for medical approaches to disability, the medical model of disability disempowers disabled people (see case study ibid p.219). If the human rights discourse is to be applied to the disabled, who represent a substantial minority world wide, then initiatives which are directly concerned with understanding rights and empowerment are called for.

Governance and empowerment

Under the heading of empowerment and good governance were Pakistan PTP and Pacific HRE. The latter showed a range of innovative approaches to establishing the right of non-discrimination, in this case against women. The learning which has taken place through the design and implementation of the project has produced a model which replicated elsewhere. The police training project represents a contribution towards the better administration of the rule of law but was initially somewhat unambitious in terms of outputs and activities. This derived from the very confined and defined visions of the nature of good governance which formed the basis upon which the project was originally constructed. The emphasising of the gender component and poverty related dimensions which took place as a result of the MTR was a reflection of how a rights orientation could be integrated into project design.

What emerges from these documents when studied in their chronological order is that a clear and significant change occurred as a result of the new policies introduced by the incoming
Labour government in 1997. This was particularly evident in respect of human rights. At this point we see the radical reappraisal of the Bosnia project into something which is deeply influenced by human rights norms and the Pakistan PRLC which is directly concerned with the rights of the child. Poverty alleviation, in line with the aspirations set out in the 1997 White Paper, was reflected in further support for additional phases to the Calcutta SIP, India RFP and Wajir PDP projects.

However the study threw up instances where it was unclear how rights were being prioritised and whose interests were at the heart of the project. For example, in the case of Pakistan PRLC, one may ask why the principal focus of the project is children involved in football stitching, when only 5% of footballer stitchers are children. This is one of the least hazardous of activities affecting a relatively small number of children, while children elsewhere in Pakistan are experiencing acute problems, not only of poverty but of oppression and abuse. If the criteria for action in this region of Pakistan is based upon the Convention on the Rights of the Child, then consistency indicates that initiatives need to be targeted to situations where children are forced into arduous and perilous activities, where they are kept in bondage or are abused in the workplace as a matter of routine. This project also raised questions about the role of western economic interests in influencing how the rights of Pakistani children should best be defended.

**Key findings, models of good practice and lessons learned**

In seeking to draw conclusions about the general characteristics of DFID/ODA’s policy from this randomly selected group of ten projects, the first comment to be made concerns the diversity of epistemologies which appear to lie behind projects. The documentation from high SD content projects (India RFP, Calcutta SIP & Wajir) reads as though they are, to varying degrees, taking a position that heeds individuals, seeks to address poverty in a sustainable manner not just in a technical sense but also through capacity building. So from the stance of economic rights these types of projects indicate a distinctive position.

Over the seven years covered by these projects, it can be seen that efforts to mainstream gender have born fruit. An increasing concern for gender disparity has been reflected in project design. However inclusion of such rights based issues in project agenda forms only a part of the task. There are structural issues relating to the issues of non-discrimination and equality which have to be acknowledged. In addition to our own domestic and regional experience, the Pacific HRE illustrates that if women are to be treated equally then there are crucial legal and institutional dimensions which must be addressed. How is DFID going to apply the lessons learned from Pacific HRE? Mainstreaming of concern for gender equity particularly when it comes to the HR agenda unavoidably involves addressing structural/legal issues in partner countries. But this raises sensitivities in respect of sovereignty and culture which have to be incorporated into the negotiation of project, process or sectoral aid.

This set of projects appear to derive from, and be formulated upon, a fairly diverse set of premises and concerns. However while it is obviously too early to comment with certainty, there are indications that the framework stated by Eyben (p.2) of policy analysis based on the human rights, social capital and social exclusion approaches is already becoming evident in
project design and implementation (e.g. Pakistan PTP, Bosnia RR, Wajir PDP II & India RFP II).
6. Key Findings and Conclusions

The study

- The process of gaining access to information for this study has been patchy. In some cases material has been easily available, in others it has been slow to arrive. Sometimes it has not been supplied at all or pages have been removed from documents.

- A study of these ten projects indicates that after the approval stage (i.e. the production of a PM and logframe) there has not been a uniform approach to the administration of the project cycle. While in most cases MTRs have been undertaken, the most obvious shortcoming is the lack of final reports. A final report for each project which provided a synthesis of qualitative and quantitative results and lessons learnt would be most valuable, particularly in respect of the comparative analysis of the project process.

Social development

- The shift from a technocratic, managerial approach to development towards one which gives fuller consideration to the human dimension is noticeable over the time period of the projects covered by this study. The incorporation of SD considerations and practice can be seen to have played a significant part in reinvigorating projects by means of redirection and/or by emphasising certain characteristics.

- Where SD perspectives are incorporated at the planning stage they can be seen to contribute towards successful outcomes, particularly in terms of the qualitative manner in which goals are addressed and achieved.

- The notion of participation requires straightforward description and elucidation. There may well be good reasons for confining participation to consultation in that the development agency/donor may have some technocratic output in mind and wants to confine the consultative processes to technically related issues and to the implementation of the project cycle they have planned. But this is not SD nor is it concerned with sustainability. Who is setting goals? Making these issues explicit would contribute to clearer project definition and implementation.

- The concept of community is incorporated into project descriptions in various ways. It would be useful to understand what type of community is being referred to. Is community a notion used in project design which on balance excludes, includes or ignores women or other important groups? The term community is readily used, but all too easily it can involve the subsuming of individual, group or factional interests. Inclusion and exclusion from communities is an important issue and was not addressed in a number of the larger projects.

- Because a project is financially small does not mean that its impact cannot be significant. This is especially so in the field of human rights initiatives. There is some concern arising from this study that smaller projects might not be getting sufficient and timely SD support.

Human rights
• A rights agenda requires that a state is obliged to respect, protect, promote and ensure the realisation of human rights. This is a fundamental statement and can be used as yardstick against which policy is measured. It applies at home as well as abroad (Häusermann 1998:79).

• The HR agenda reflects a liberal vision and places particular emphasis on the rights of the individual. This presupposes the existence of a virtuous set of state institutions to which individuals can turn to for protection and justice. It presupposes a society where individuals are free to organise themselves around issues of common concern. A rights orientated aid policy inevitably involves donors addressing structural/legal issues in partner countries where rights are not respected.

• With a rights based approach forming a cornerstone of DFID's aid policy, country policy documents could usefully include an inventory of the major rights issues. Such data could be used to strategise and prioritise assistance and assess interventions.

• A rights agenda involves the assertion of values, in one form or other, either in the micro or macro political arenas, sometimes in both. The assertion of rights therefore requires accessible institutions through which rights can be claimed and asserted. Herein lies the linkage between human rights and political arenas. The setting of intervention goals which make direct reference to the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights for example, would therefore also imply that the target group was involved in some form of political conscientisation: is this taking place? Who is defining goals? In what ways, if at all, is ownership being conferred?

• The existence of human rights is unknown to many poor people. The precursor to successful development interventions involving rights requires the transfer of knowledge, in an appropriate form, of what precisely human rights are. It means establishing what rights are important to the primary stakeholders. It means establishing the nature of what rights mean in terms of obligations. In order for interventions to take into account people's concerns, particularly the poorest, then it requires an understanding of what rights are important to them.

• The issue of the cultural relativity of human rights needs to be taken into account. Furthermore, notwithstanding the arguments against it, human rights for many people may be of a hierarchical nature. In other words the satisfying of certain economic rights could well have primacy over the desire of a target group to assert certain other rights, say of a civil or political nature. This relates to the perception of rights by the target group in question.

• There exist issues of conflicting and competing rights. These are often manifest as a conflict between individual rights and the common good. An obvious example being the rights of an American citizen to bear arms and the right to walk the streets in safety. Conflicting or competing rights can frequently occur where there are ethnic sensitivities.
• A stakeholder analysis which provides information about the various forms of interest held by actors in a project would be useful in assessing HR correlative duties and providing information which could be used in the risks and assumptions column of the logframe.

• In order to integrate a rights orientated approach into development programmes a set of practical guidelines would be most useful. These could provide practical guidance based on case study experience as to how human rights can best be integrated into the process approach, sectoral aid and the different types of involvement associated with focused, inclusive and enabling activities.
Bibliography


Evans, P. (1998). *Partnerships, the poverty aim marker (PAM), and the shape of country programme portfolios*. Discussion Note. London: DFID.


DFID Project Documents:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1997-98</td>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>Western Bosnia Rehabilitation Programme (Bosnia RP) - Project Memorandum 1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998-99</td>
<td>Bosnia</td>
<td>Western Bosnia Return and Reconciliation Project (Bosnia RR) - Project Head Sheet (PIMS) 1998 - Project Memorandum + logframe 1998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991-96</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Calcutta Slum Improvement Project (Calcutta SIP) - Project Memorandum 1991 + logframe - Participatory Impact Assessment 1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-2001</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Calcutta Slum Improvement Project £2.33 million - Project Memorandum 1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Project Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993-97</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>KRIBHCO Rainfed Farming Project Phase 1 (extended to 1999)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999-2005</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>KRIBHCO Rainfed Farming Project Phase 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994-97</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>Oxfam Wajir Pastoral Development Programme (Wajir PDP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-1999</td>
<td>Mozambique</td>
<td>Feeder Roads Project (Mozambique FRP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-1998</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>Police Training Project (Pakistan PTP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-2000</td>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>SCF Child Labour Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(Pakistan PRLC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994-97</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>NGO: Society for Disabled Children (Uganda DC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>